

ENHANCING PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIP IN TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET): THE HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT AND INSTITUTIONAL PRACTICE APPROACHES

BY

**ABANYAM, VICTOR ATAH; ABANYAM, FRIDAY EKAHE
& AWOLI, AGNES EWURU**

Department of Vocational Education
University of Calabar

Abstract

The phenomenon of reduced finances, whether modest or considerable, obviously serves to challenge institutions of higher education to improve human resource development and promote practical oriented activities in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) institutions in Nigeria. Thus the major purpose of the study was to determine the approaches in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. Two research questions and hypotheses guided the study. The study adopted a descriptive survey research design and was conducted in Cross River State. The population for the study was 151 made up of 65 officials of the Ministry of Education, 44 managers of industries and 42 lecturers of the of the Department of Vocational Education of the University of Calabar and the Cross River State University of Technology. The entire population was studied. A structured questionnaire containing 44 items was used to collect data for the study and was analyzed using mean to answer the research questions and ANOVA statistic to test the two null hypotheses at .05 significant level. It was found out that human resource development and institutional practices improve PPP in TVET. Conclusion was made and it was recommended amongst others that grants should be made available to graduate trainees by all partners involved in order to build, develop and maintain strong partnerships for TVET in Nigeria.

Key word: *Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET), Public-Private Partnership, National Developments*

Introduction

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is a comprehensive term referring to all forms and levels of the educational process involving, in addition to general knowledge, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, know-how, attitudes and understanding relating to occupations in the various sectors of economic and social life (UNESCO, 2011). This definition highlights the fact that TVET is design to train skilled and entrepreneurial workforce that needs to create wealth that would help reduce the menace of poverty and unemployment.

Unfortunately, TVET has long been neglected in Nigeria. This seems so because for now TVET lacks effectiveness and relevance to the realities of the work place, even in those occupational fields that shows high demand for

skilled workforce. The bold step to introduce introductory technology instruction at secondary school level has long been poorly managed and currently nearly abandoned. Egboh and Chukwuemeka (2012) noted with regret that less than 1% of secondary education in Nigeria is oriented towards technical and vocational skills. Worse still, workshops for TVET at tertiary education level often showcase dumps of outdated and obsolete machines, equipment and tools. There is a serious deficiency in terms of trained human capital. Most teachers of TVET are formally qualified for their task to train middle level workforce. However, their real performance is inadequate because their practical technical competences, pedagogical preparation and motivation are undeveloped. These ugly situations could be attributed to inadequate funding of education by the government at all

levels in Nigeria. As Okuwa (2005) puts it, the Nigerian educational system has been witnessing an explosion in the context of declining resource inputs particularly from the government. Since poor and inadequate funding have been a long standing issue facing technology and vocational education and training in Nigeria, it is therefore imperative to develop an alternative approach to funding of TVET programmes which will transform the present supply-driven system to a system that is responsive to technical education and training needs of the population and the industries. One measure that would address the problem to favour TVET is the Public-Private Partnership (PPP) strategy.

As stated by Aina and Akintunde (2013), Public-Private Partnership in Education (PPPE) is a relationship in which the public (government) and private resources voluntarily collaborate for achieving educational goals. This arrangement always specifies targets, responsibilities, priorities and feedback processes. It primarily involves sharing of resources, knowledge and risks between the two sectors so that the country at large can benefit from the arrangement (Oni & Akinbinu, 2005).

The personnel composition and structure of any private public partnership is unique. Accordingly, the government as the main partner of TVET may be vested with the responsibilities of law and policy-making, controlling quality management of the TVET system and providing support to TVET institutions. The private sector, on the other hand, is expected to provide in-company TVET training programs, apply best experiences for quality training programmes and improve the supply of the TVET system through the use of resources (Woldetsadik & Lumadi, 2015).

Public Private Partnership is of great importance to economic growth of any nation. It has important implications for the role of the state vis-à-vis the private sector as a provider of public services, including education systems (Education International, 2009). The most

common reason advanced for partnerships is to ensure successful labour market outcome by ensuring quick absorption of graduates into the workplace. Other reasons advanced include, upgrading of machinery and equipments reducing skills shortage and mismatch, adopting business principles in the management of TVET programmes. Collan and Ashworth (2004) added that, partnership offers clear opportunities to generate new streams of income for TVET programmes. Partnerships permit governments to improve on their services and programs by offering complementary services, such as vocational training, occupational and career education, workplace training/education, technical assistance, and public programs to encourage public support (Okoye & Okwelle, 2013)

The complicated nature of the labour market demands that human resources are sufficiently prepared in technological know-how to deal with the situation. This demand has placed much emphasis on TVET worldwide, more essentially as Nigeria was ranked 158th out of 177 countries, below the average for sub-Saharan Africa in human development (UNDP, 2008). This implies greater unity and partnership between the public and private sectors in TVET for adequate technological advancement and human development (Ezeji, 2011). TVET-PPP in Nigeria exists at different levels with different kind of partners depending on what is to be achieved from the partnership. TVET partnership exist at policy, training, design and development levels with the United Nations Education, Scientific and Cultural Organizations (UNESCO); Africa Development Bank (AFDB); United Nations Development Program (UNDP); International Labor Organization (ILO).

Similarly the National Board for Technical Education (NBTE) is into PPP with different organizations in Nigeria to facilitate TVET Development (Maigida, 2014).

These partnerships have not impacted sufficiently on skill needs of Nigerians. World Bank (2011) reported that TVET institutions have continued to produce graduates for

outdated and marginal trades with little market demand while not training for newer trades with substantial needs as there are indications that one-fourth of the employers in the cities complained of shortage of skills and low level of skills produce by TVET institutions. This report applies to Nigeria as most of the TVET programmes are target oriented with a typical bureaucratic top-down approach to training. Training curricular is rigid and not regularly updated as per the changing needs of the labour market. Maigida (2014) also asserted that most TVET institutions have little capacity to make quick responses to labour market changes, thus hindering the achievements of partnership goals. To achieve the partnership goals in Nigeria, partnership must significantly improve on efficiency-enhancing factors. These include higher investment in human resources funding system and vocationalization of institutions. According to Zain (2008), innovative strategies that could be devised to revamp TVET for effective PPP are categorized into Human Resource Development Fund (HRDF) and Vocationalization of Tertiary Institutions (VTI).

In the human resource development fund system of TVET partnership, the government would introduce a training levy-reimbursement scheme to all the participating industries, who in certain apprentice training programs, qualify for tax incentives. These industries and companies also collect 1% part of the training cost from the government plus other hidden user charges. These incentives motivate healthy competition and improved performance among companies in the technical and vocational training offered to the students. The students/apprentices are assured of employment, reimbursement of training cost and given insurance protection, among others. Through this scheme, accelerated industrial training is provided (Maigida, 2014). The scheme also offers opportunities and avenues for companies, industry associations and public/private industrial training institutions to contribute to more responsive and relevant skill development. It is possible that the

management of industrial training fund (ITF) in Nigeria could adopt and modify this system and make it a trial various institutions in Nigeria.

The institutional activities would involve a broad range of actions from all participating partners to ensure effective demand driven TVET programmes. These actions would help in incorporating theoretical and practical-oriented activities which provide opportunities to the students by undergoing intensive and active practical sessions. Active practical training is an instructional technique with focus on the learner interacting with the subject matter content of a course through active participation in generating ideas, rather than be a passive listener and a receiver of knowledge (Zain, 2008). It also requires that the teacher acts as a facilitator rather than a talker (Salman, 2009). Abanyam (2014) observed that relevant practices of TVET education emphasizes that all vocational lessons to be learnt by students must be activity oriented. It should allow students' active participation in learning to be meaningful. It should relate content to daily experiences of the students, and should provide opportunities for both sexes to take active roles in the lesson. It must also be culturally rooted. That is, the relevance of TVET or its usefulness in Nigerian culture must be identified and made known to the generality of the students. The concept for instruction must be consistent with the curriculum contents for a particular level of education (Abanyam, 2014). This way, competent skilled work force for national development would have been produced. On this note therefore, the study intends to determine the approaches in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.

Statement of the Problem

As knowledge and skills advance in today's workplace, there is an increasing demand for well-trained entry-level workers. Increasing number of companies are establishing partnership training agreements in order to be competitive, productive and to ensure continued success in the world-of-work. The

phenomenon of reduced human resource funding in TVET institutions, obviously serves to challenge TVET institutions to fulfil the goals for which the institutions were established. As human resource funding linked with governmental sources wanes, TVET institutions are seeking alternative modes of funding to increase existing revenue and improve the quality of the teachers to effectively impact on the students functional training, relevant to labour market needs, become increasingly more important than educational achievements. Thus, the thrust of this study is to determine approaches in public private partnership to improve TVET for national development.

Purpose of the Study

The major purpose of the study was to determine the approaches in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. Specifically, the study sought to determine the:

1. Human resource development practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development
2. Institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development

Research Questions

The following questions guided the study:

1. What are the human resource development practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development?
2. What are the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development?

Hypot] *Abanyam V. A, Abanyam F, E. & Awoli A. E.*
The following hypotheses guided the study

1. Officials of the Ministry of Education, managers of industries and lecturers do not differ significantly on the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.
2. There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of the officials of the Ministry of Education, managers of industries and

lecturers on the institutional practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.

Methodology

The study adopted a descriptive survey research design and was conducted in Cross River State. The population for the study was 151 made up of 65 officials of the Ministry of Education, 44 managers of industries and 42 lecturers of the of the Department of Vocational Education of the University of Calabar and the Cross River State University of Technology. The entire population was studied due to its manageable size. These groups of respondents were considered necessary in PPP and as such, would effectively represent their respective interest. A structured questionnaire containing 44 items and a response scale of Strongly Agree (SA), Agree (A), Disagree (D), and Strongly Disagree (SD) with nominal values of 4, 3, 2, and 1 respectively was used to elicit responses from respondents and generate data for the study. The instrument was face-validated by three experts and was subjected to reliability test. The internal consistency of the items of the questionnaire was ascertained through Cronbach Alpha technique which yielded a coefficient of 0.81 considered high enough : *Abanyam V. A, Abanyam F, E. & Awoli A. E.*

Method of Data Analysis

The data collected for the study was analyzed using mean to answer the research questions and standard deviation to determine the closeness or otherwise of the responses from the mean, ANOVA statics was used to test the null hypotheses at .05 significant levels. In taking decision, any item with a mean of 2.50 and above was considered accepted, while any mean score below 2.50 was taken as rejected. In the test of hypotheses, hypothesis of no significant difference was accepted when the computed probability value was greater than .05 level of significance. Where the calculated probability value was less than 0.05 level of significance, the null hypothesis was rejected. The findings of the study are presented and discussed as follows:

Research Question1

What are the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development?

Table 1: Mean ratings on the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development

S/no	ITEMS	\bar{X}	SD	Rmk.
1	Partnering in providing grants to TVET students on graduation	3.34	.80	A
2	Establishment of TVET institutions and industries partnership intervention fund scheme	3.27	.75	A
3	Giving national award to industries that effectively developed TVET human resources	3.21	.83	A
4	Granting of loans to TVET institutions to develop human resources	3.21	.83	A
5	Tax reduction for TVET institution and industries in partnership	3.13	.83	A
6	Provision of employment opportunities for trainees	3.19	.73	A
7	Assisting in placement of persons seeking employment	3.20	.79	A
8	Promoting employment projects	3.22	.81	A
9	Developing training schemes for employment of trainees	3.17	.86	A
10	Monitor training schemes for employment of trainees	3.22	.83	A
11	Providing finance for training schemes	3.24	.78	A
12	Total reimbursement of training cost	3.30	.84	A
14	Adequate provision of insurance protection to TVET personnel	3.14	.75	A
15	Utilizing specific percentage of Income tax for the provision of workshop facilities to TVET institutions	3.29	.82	A
16	Rewarding overall performance in national exams	3.55	.75	A
17	Scholarships for children	3.45	.73	A
18	Providing grants for classroom project	3.38	.71	A
19	Development of infrastructure for schools	3.28	.77	A
20	Provision of regular in-service training	3.34	.84	A
21	Additional pay for assuming additional responsibilities as a Master or mentor teacher	3.45	.73	A
22	Merit pay bonus for exceptional performance os students	3.29	.69	A
23	Paying overtime	3.37	.75	A
24	Awarding certificate of merit to outstanding student	3.25	.71	A
25	Provision of hardship allowance to deserving student	3.25	.71	A

Abanyam V. A, Abanyam F, E. & Awoli A. E.

Table 1 presented the mean ratings of respondents on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. Items 1-25 recorded mean ratings ranging from 3.14-3.55, which were

above the cut off mark of 2.5 thus indicating that all 25 items were the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.

Hypothesis 1

Officials of the Ministry of Education, Managers of industries and lecturers do not differ significantly on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development

Table 2: Analysis of Variance Test for the Responses of the three Groups on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.

Source of square	Sum of square	Df	Mean square	F-ratio	P-value (sig)	Rmk.
Between groups	.180	3	0.06			
Within groups	81.17	387	0.21	0.29	.8.84	NNS
Total	81.35	390				

Table 2 presents the summary of Analysis of Variance test of the responses of Officials of the Ministry of Education, Managers of industries and lecturers on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. From the table, F-value of 0.29 with a P-value as .84 and 148 was greater than

.05 indicating that there is no difference in the mean responses of the three groups on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. Therefore, the null hypothesis of no significance difference was upheld.

Research Question 2

What are the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development?

Table 3: Mean responses on the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development

S/NO	ITEMS	\bar{X}	SD	Rmk
26	Improving the link between TVET institutions and all partnerships	3.16	.94	A
27	Responsiveness of TVET institutions to local and international vocational trends	3.13	.91	A
28	Establishing systems with accountability framework	3.14	.89	A
29	Ensuring the utilization of cost effective techniques for teaching/learning	3.20	.91	A
30	Ensuring an effective demand driven TVET programmes	3.40	.84	A
31	Modularization of TVET programmes	3.22	.79	A
32	Providing training that corresponds with the labour market	3.23	.81	A
33	Ensuring that training corresponds with intended procedures	3.09	.84	A
34	Development of a comprehensive technology plan to integrate ICT in the delivery of training	3.25	.78	A
35	Training programmes to emphasize team work	<i>Abanyam V. A, Abanyam F, E. & Awoli A. E.</i>		
36	Self monitoring, shouldering of common responsibilities			
37	Involving all partners in developing pedagogy for trainers	3.55	.75	A
38	Partnering with TVET institutions in providing relevant work experience schemes	3.45	.73	A

39	Involving all partners in developing training needs analysis	3.38	.71	A
40	Involving all partners in developing policy legislation for TVET institutions	3.28	.77	A
41	Giving regular feedback to all partners	3.34	.84	A
42	Involving all partners in developing occupational needs analysis	3.45	.73	A
43	Implementing plans for goal attainment	3.29	.69	A
44	Evaluating all activities based on set goals	3.37	.75	A

Table 3 presents the mean ratings of respondents on the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development. Items 26-44 recorded mean ratings ranging from 3.09 to 3.40, which were above the cut off mark of 2.5, thus indicating that all 19 items were the institutional practices

in PPP to improve TVET for national development.

Hypothesis 2

There is no significant difference in the mean ratings of the officials of the Ministry of Education, Managers of industries and lecturers on the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development.

Table 4: Analysis of Variance Test for the responses of the three Groups on the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development

Source of square	Sum of square	Df	Mean square	F-ratio	P-value (sig)	Rmk.
Between groups	.180	3	0.06			
Within groups	81.17	387	0.21	0.87	.46	NS
Total	81.35	390				

Table 4 presents the summary of Analysis of Variance test of the responses of the officials of the Ministry of Education, Managers of industries and lecturers on the relevant practices of TVET institution in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. From the table, F-value of 0.87 with a P-value as .46 at .05 and 148 degree of freedom is greater than .05 indicating that, there is no significant difference in the mean responses of the three groups on the institutional practices in PPP to improve TVET for national development. Therefore, the null hypothesis of no significance difference was upheld.

Discussion of Findings

Findings on the human resource development funds in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development indicated that all the identified items are the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national

development. Also, there was no significant difference in the mean responses of the officials of the Ministry of Education, Managers of industries and lecturers on the human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. These findings are in agreement with Maigida (2014) who observed that when the students/apprentices are assured of employment, eligible for total reimbursement of training cost and given insurance protection, among others would motivate a healthy competition and improved performance among companies in the technical and vocational training offered to the students Through this scheme, accelerated industrial training is provided. Findings on the relevant practices of TVET institution in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development indicating that all enlisted items were the relevant practices of TVET institution in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for

national development. The findings in this regards also revealed that there was no significant difference in the mean responses of the three groups on the relevant practices of TVET institution in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. These findings are in support of the assertion by Patrinos, Barrera-Osorio, and Guáqueta (2009), who stated that the above practices are principles for designing and implementing a relevant TVET programme in public-private partnerships for national development.

Conclusion

The purpose of this study was to determine approaches in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development. It was therefore concluded that human resource development practices in Public Private Partnership and several institutional activities were presented as positive approaches in Public Private Partnership to improve TVET for national development.

References

- Abanyam, F. E. (2014). Self-employment skills possessed by business education students of colleges of education for sustainable development in Cross River State, Nigeria. An unpublished M.Ed. thesis of the Department of Vocational Teacher Education, University of Nigeria Nsukka.
- Aina, J. K., & Akintunde, Z.T. (2013). Repositioning science education in Nigerian colleges of education through public- private partnership (ppp). *Science Journal of Education*, 1(5), 64-67.
- Collan and Ashworth (2004). *Competency development in technical vocational education and training*. Margret publishers GMBH, Germany: Wakerrshein.
- Education International (2009). Public Private Partnerships in Education. http://download.eiie.org/Docs/WebDepot/200909_Publication_Public-Private-Partnership-in-Education_en.pdf. Retrieved on 27/06/2015.
- Egboh, E. A. & Chukwuemeka, E. (2012). Public- Private Partnership in Nigeria: The Challenges of Human Relations Management. *Kuwait Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 1(5), 99 – 113.
- Ezeji, S.C.O.A. (2011). Public/Private Partnership and Technology, Vocational Education and Training (TVET). A lead paper presented at the 24th Annual National Conference of the Nigerian Association of Teachers of Technology (NATT) at Federal College of Education (Technical), Umunze.
- Maigida, J. F. (2014). Building and sustaining partnerships through public private partnership for effective technical vocational education and training programme in Nigeria. A paper presentation at the International Vocational Education Association (IVETA) conference November, 18-19, 2014. Nashville, Tennessee, US
- Okoye, K.R.E. & Okwelle, P.C. (2013.) Private-public partnership and technical vocational Education and training (tv et) in a developing economy. *Arabian*

Recommendations

The following recommendations were made for the study

1. Grants and other related human development funds should be made available to graduate trainees by all partners involved.
2. The private sector should be encouraged to initiate and participate in the provision of TVET facilities for effective skill acquisition.
3. Industries should be sought as partners in progress to assist in the provision of TVET training facilities. This could be achieved through interactions with TVET institutions
4. Linkages between schools and the private sector should be strengthened to ensure appropriate interface with the world of work. This could be achieved through constant invitation of private sectors participate in school TVET programmes.

- Journal of Business and Management Review (OMAN Chapter)*, 2(10), 51-61.
- Okuwa, O.B. (2005). Public-private partnership of higher education financing in Nigeria: the case of user fees. *Revitalization of African higher Education*,1, 126-148
- Oni, B. & Akinbinu eds. (2005). *Public private partnership in Nigeria: A multi-disciplinary approach*. Ibadan, NISER.
- Patrinos, H. A., Barrera-Osorio, F., & Guáqueta, J. (2009). *The role and impact of public-private partnerships in education*. Washington: World Bank.
- Salman, M. F. (2009). Active learning techniques (alt) in a mathematics workshop; Nigerian primary school teachers' assessment *International Electronic Journal of Mathematics Education* retrieved on the 22/6/2015 from www.iejme.com
- UNDP (2008). Human development report 2007/2008. African Economic Outlook. Pp 518
- UNESCO (2011). Technical and vocational education and training. <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/education/themes/education-building-bi> Retrieved on 10/7/2015.
- Woldetsadik1, D. A. & Lumadi, M. W. (2015). Missing Link: Partnership of Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Colleges and Industries in Addis Ababa. *J Economics*, 6(1): 74-78
- World Bank (2011). *Learning for all: investing in people's knowledge and skills to promote development: World Bank group educational strategies 2020*. Washington DC: World Bank
- Zain, Z.M. (2008). TVET in Malaysia. <http://dspace.unimap.edu.my/dspace/bitstream/123456789/7186/1/TVET%20in%20Malaysia.pdf>. Retrieved 10/10/201

